

# PLYMOUTH'S PARK & RIDE

## Scrutiny Panel Report



### Introduction

As part of the Scrutiny Panel investigation into the operation of the City's Park & Ride services, Officers were asked to respond to a series of requests for information from the meeting on the 18 November 2013. This report details those requests.

### Requests for Information

- 1) Members would be provided with the Council's parking policy for the Life Centre.

This request was in light of evidence from Julian Egan, Life Centre Manager, explaining that he was of the understanding the Life Centre car park was for the use of all Central Park users. The Car Park Management Plan which is included as an appendix within the Life Centre Travel Plan for Staff and Visitors states the following which confirms Julian's statement, 'Under planned arrangements, day to day use of the Plymouth Life Centre car park will be free to all Plymouth Life Centre and Central Park users.' A copy of the full Travel Plan will be brought to the next Scrutiny meeting on 2 December.

- 2) Members would be provided with the data regarding comparable rates for similar bus journeys at Norwich and Chester to assess if they were significantly higher than the Park & Ride Fares.

The tables below details the Park & Ride fares and comparisons with the nearest standard bus services for Norwich, Chester and Plymouth.

KEY: AS = Adult Single, AR = Adult Return

**Table 1: Fare comparisons between Norwich and Chester P&R services and nearest local bus services.**

Location / Service	Park & Ride AS	Park & Ride AR	Local Bus services AS	Local Bus Services AR
<b>Norwich</b>	£2.40 before 12.30  £2.10 after 12.30	£2.40 before 12.30  £2.10 after 12.30	n/a	£3.00 to £4.20
<b>Chester</b>	£2.00	£2.00	n/a	£3.00 to £3.50

**Table 2: Fare comparisons between Plymouth P&R services and nearest local bus services.**

<b>Location / Service</b>	<b>PRI AS</b>	<b>PRI AR</b>	<b>FSW 83 AS</b>	<b>FSW 83 AR</b>	<b>PCB 12 AS</b>	<b>PCB 12 AR</b>	<b>PR2 AS</b>	<b>PR2 AR</b>	<b>PCB 21/A AS</b>	<b>PCB 21/A AR</b>
<b>George Park &amp; Ride</b>	£2.40	£2.70	£2.80	£3.50	£2.30	£3.30				
<b>Milehouse Park &amp; Ride</b>	£1.45	£2.00	£1.10	£2.00	£1.00	£1.80				
<b>Coypool Park &amp; Ride</b>							£2.10	£2.30	£2.10	£3.20

- 3) Officers would investigate the legality of no longer accepting concessionary bus passes at Plymouth’s Park & Ride sites as part of the Travel Concessions (Eligible Services) (Amendment) 2009

**Direct quote from The Travel Concessions (Eligible Services) (Amendment) 2009:**

“2 (3)

4.—(1) A service is not an eligible service under section 146 of the Transport Act 2000 if—...

(e) the fare for the service includes a special amenity element....

(4) For the purpose of paragraph (1) (e) a fare is to be regarded as including a special amenity element if it is significantly high in relation to the general level of fares for comparable journeys.’

**Statement from Mark Lawrence, PCC Lawyer.**

*The Travel Concessions (Eligible Services)(Amendment)Order 2009 Paragraph 2(3) clarifies when a service is not an eligible service under section 146 of the Transport Act 2000. One of the five criteria included is where the fare for the service includes a special amenity element. A fare is to be regarded as including a special amenity element if it is significantly high in relation to the general level of fares for comparable journeys. In order to meet the requirements of this Order substantive evidence would need to be provided by an authority to support the argument as to whether parking is an amenity, and whether the fare is able to be regarded as a special amenity element if it is significantly high in relation to the general level of fares for comparable journeys. If substantive evidence cannot be provided to support the statutory requirements then the authority would be open to legal challenge and possibly a judicial review’.*

Table I shows the fares for Plymouth’s Park & Ride services against the fares for the nearest standard local bus service. If parking and the provision of site facilities such as toilets and intermittent site supervision are considered an amenity then the fares must be considered against those for comparable journeys. The application of the Travel Concessions (Eligible Services) (Amendment) 2009 may depend upon how comparable the journeys offered by the nearest local bus services are against the specific Park and Ride services in question. A table is shown below showing the distances for the pick up and drop off points between the Park & Ride service and the nearest local bus service for each site. It also shows the scheduled journey times.

**Table 3: Comparisons between P&R services and nearest local bus services.**

<b>Site / Journey factor</b>	<b>Nearest alternative inbound service 'Pick up'</b>	<b>Nearest alternative outbound service 'Drop off'</b>	<b>Journey time P&amp;R</b>	<b>Journey time Alternative service (s)</b>
<b>PR1 George Junction</b>	-190 metres	-120 metres	-22 minutes to Royal Parade	-21 minutes on service 12 to Royal Parade -20 minutes on service 83 to Royal Parade
<b>PR1 Milehouse</b>	-Same location	-100 metres from North drop off on perimeter Road.	-9 minutes to Royal Parade	-8 minutes on service 12 to Royal Parade -9 minutes on service 83 to Royal Parade
<b>PR2 Coypool</b>	-300 metres -520 metres accessible route	-320 metres	-11 minutes to first City Centre drop off -14 minutes to Royal Parade	-13 minutes to first City Centre drop off on service 21 -15 minutes on service 21 to Royal Parade
<b>PR3 George Junction</b>	-Same location	-120 metres	-8 minutes to Derriford	-10 minutes on service 15 from George to Derriford

Distances are not exact and were derived from the online mapping tool available at [www.walkjogrun.net](http://www.walkjogrun.net).

## **VAT**

It should be noted that if the Council were to identify that there is an amenity element linked to parking within the Park & Ride fare then VAT may possibly be attributed to this specific element.

- 4) Officers would confirm the closure date for the car park at Derriford (off Brest Road).

The Council are working to a date of May 2014 by which time the NHS Trust will hopefully have identified alternative parking solutions for those staff members affected. The Council is working closely with the NHS Trust to find such alternative short, medium and long term sustainable solutions for their staff travel needs.

- 5) Officers would confirm if a public consultation was required to take place if concessionary bus passes were to be no longer accepted.

There is nothing in the Travel Concessions (Eligible Services) (Amendment) 2009 which states that a consultation would need to be undertaken.